

A One-way Mirror: Spanish Historiography Facing the Withdrawal of Annual (Anwal, 1921)*

Alfonso Bermúdez Mombiela
Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona

Abstract: The aim of this article is to provide a balanced review of the current state of Spanish historiography on the history of the Spanish Protectorate in Morocco, with a particular focus on the academic pieces related to the Disaster/Battle of Annual (Anwal) in 1921. A historiographic review of the broad range of academic works on the subject is conducted, evaluating the current state of this area of study at an academic level, as well as the challenges and problems faced by this type of historiography. The article concludes that while there has been a significant increase in the amount of works on Annual, not all of them have the same academic value. Additionally, Spanish historiography on the history of the Protectorate has not engaged a productive dialogue with Moroccan historiography and at the same time is marginalised within the most dominant academic spheres in the Spanish university system.

Keywords: Spanish Historiography, Morocco, Annual (Anwal), 1921.

Introduction: A Complex and Challenging Panorama

A one-way mirror, also referred to as a semi-transparent mirror, is a type of glass that is partially reflective and partially transparent. It permits light to pass through in one direction while reflecting light in the other direction. The side with more light observes a reflection, while the side with less light sees through the glass. It appears as a regular mirror, reflecting the surroundings from the well-lit side. However, from the dark side, it functions as a transparent window, allowing observers to view the well-lit area.

In many aspects, it can be said that Spanish historiography on the Spanish Protectorate in Morocco is in a state of isolation, in the room of the one-way mirror that can only observe in one direction, but it does not get the look back from the other side. At the same time, it is also located in the adjacent room, which is only visible from one side, but does not reciprocate the gaze. On the one hand, the hegemonic academic historiography has relegated Spanish historiography of Morocco to the dark room, since although the authors who deal with the Protectorate try to get closer to the academic circuit, the reality shows that they are still far from it. Nevertheless, at the same time, Spanish historiography of Spain and Morocco has placed its Moroccan counterparts in the dark room, mostly ignoring the work done across the Strait of Gibraltar. In this context, a parallel can be drawn to Susan Martín-Márquez's critique of Said's Orientalist theory, contending that Spain,

while being orientalised within Europe, simultaneously orientalised the colonial subject.¹ Consequently, Spanish historiography on the history of the Protectorate finds itself in an uneasy position, marginalised within the academic discourse of the Spanish university. Simultaneously, it grapples with the challenge of establishing a meaningful connection with Moroccan historiography.

The traditional historical narrative of Morocco and the Spanish Protectorate, and particularly the events of 1921, has long been a challenge in the annals of Spanish history. Historiographers have often struggled with an uncertain methodology when approaching the subject due to its complexity. Indeed, for a long time the Moroccan campaigns were marginalised and given only cursory attention. The causes were briefly explained, while the consequences were generally enumerated. Although it is widely acknowledged that these military events had a profound impact on the final crisis of the Restoration and the subsequent establishment of Primo de Rivera's dictatorship, which culminated in the proclamation of the Second Republic in 1931, the complex integration of these events into the broader tapestry of Spanish history remains an enduring challenge. In most general works covering various aspects of Spain during that period, which continue to be published continuously, Spanish involvement in Morocco, and the "domestic blowback" of colonialism, often do not receive the attention or significance that they rightfully deserve.²

Nevertheless, integrating these narratives into the hegemonic academic discourse of the Spanish university has been and continues to be a real challenge. In September 2023, the XVI Congress of the Spanish Contemporary History Association (AHC) unfolded as a pivotal gathering, designed to serve as a focal point wherein scholars could present and deliberate upon the issues, themes, and lines of research currently captivating the expansive community orbiting Spanish contemporary historiography. As its own bases stipulated, the congress was proposed as "a reference forum in which all questions, themes or lines of research that currently interest and occupy the broad community that gathers around contemporary historiography can be presented and debated."³ Titled "Miradas al pasado, miradas al presente. Nuevos horizontes de la historiografía contemporánea," this congress featured 60 workshop tables facilitating discourse on pivotal subjects within

*1. This publication is part of Grant FJC2021-046576-I funded by MICIU/AEI /10.13039/501100011033 and by European Union NextGenerationEU/PRTR. Likewise, special thanks go to Professor Eloy Martín Corrales for his thorough reading and corrections of this text, and to doctoral student at Abdelmalek Essaâdi University of Tetouan, Randa Sordo, for translating the abstract into Arabic.

Susan Martin-Márquez, *Disorientations: Spanish Colonialism in Africa and the Performance of Identity* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008).

2. In other countries, such as the United Kingdom, these concepts have been substantially developed by the Manchester School, led by John M. Mackenzie, which focused on the study of this "popular imperialism" with collections such as the famous series of books, *Studies in Imperialism*, published by Manchester University Press. As an example: John M. Mackenzie (ed.), *European empires and the people: popular responses to imperialism in France, Britain, the Netherlands, Belgium, Germany and Italy* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2011).

3. Likewise, one of the main objectives of the congress was "to provide an extraordinary opportunity to learn about the current state of contemporary historiography, while forming an ideal space to survey its future horizons." <https://ahc2023.unirioja.es/> [Online] last consultation on 05/03/2024.

contemporary Spanish historiography. Over a three-day span, 523 communications were presented by active historians on the Spanish stage.⁴

Upon examining these 523 communications and 60 workshop tables, it becomes apparent that there is a significant gap. First, there was no dedicated workshop table specifically addressing the History of Spain and Morocco. Additionally, among the numerous communications, only two had titles directly related to Morocco, with a mere three others tangentially engaging with Spanish colonialism in North Africa, primarily focusing on the decolonisation of Western Sahara. Regarding the period of the Spanish Protectorate in Morocco (1912-1956), only two communications briefly mentioned the topic. Regarding the Annual events in 1921, they were mentioned only once, albeit in passing.

In essence, within the preeminent biennial congress of Spanish contemporary historiography, which convenes the foremost contemporary historians, the inclusion of all communications referencing Morocco, or the History of the Protectorate barely surpassed 1% of the total 523 communications. This stark reality paints a desolate panorama, underscoring a palpable lacuna in scholarly engagement with this historically significant facet of Spain's past. At the same time, there was no historian of Moroccan nationality among the more than 500 participants, even though researchers of more than fifteen different nationalities, not only Spanish, took part. Another symptom of the disconnection between the hegemonic historiographical narrative and the other side of the Strait, despite the limited geographical distance of just 14 kilometres.

A Long Journey of Highs and Lows

However, despite the apparent marginalisation of the History of Morocco and Spanish-Moroccan relations within the academic circuit, it would be unfair to lapse into pessimism, as there are signs that the situation is gradually improving, with a growing body of historiography dedicated to Morocco. Although integrating this narrative into the overarching history of Spain has been persistently challenging, there is a discernible body of work addressing the intricacies of this historical relationship. The complexity and perceived lack of interest may be the reasons for the challenges. Nevertheless, this historiographical landscape is considered a discipline that runs parallel to the official history of Spain, operating outside the bounds of the hegemonic historiographical narrative.⁵ Unfortunately, this body of work remains relatively obscure and is seldom utilised beyond the confines of footnotes or as a supplemental component to broader historical narratives.

The centenary of the Annual events provides an example of historical neglect. Even though since 2021 there have been works of an accomplished academic

4. <https://ahc2023.unirioja.es/contenido/programa> [Online] last consultation on 05/03/2024.

5. Nonetheless, as a sad consolation, it can be said that this process is not unique to Spanish case. For instance, French historian Bernie Sèbe, when speaking about the relationship between the colonial and national historiographies of France and Great Britain, stated not so long ago that, for too long, national and 'colonial' history had tended to ignore each other *superbement*, as if they remained prisoners of parallel lanes condemned never to merge. Bernie Sèbe, *Heroic imperialists in Africa. The promotion of British and French colonial heroes, 1870-1939* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2013), 5.

nature which have contributed significantly to the advancement of knowledge on this subject, unfortunately, as it will be seen later, much of the published literature surrounding this event is ideologically biased, which undermines its objectivity. Collective works, marked by a disparity of contributions, fail to offer a balanced perspective, and much of the bibliography, especially that produced by the military establishment or by descendants of military personnel, exhibits a nationalistic inspiration, sometimes bordering on hypernationalism. Hence, it falls short of providing a comprehensive and reasoned vision of Spanish-Moroccan relations throughout history, especially in the XXth century. This is especially noticeable when referring to the summer of 1921's Annual events. Historiographies from both Morocco and Spain have not even agreed yet on a name for these events, as while Moroccan historiography labels them as a "Battle," Spanish accounts refer to them as a "Disaster."⁶

In any case, since its awakening after the events of 1921, the Annual historiography has made great strides in writing, starting from the very moment in which the so-called "Disaster" occurred, with authors who justified Spain's military action in Morocco, such as Bastos Ansart, Alfredo Cabanillas, Gonzalo Calvo, Goy de Silva or Carlos Maturana Vargas.⁷ These authors defended Army officials in the responsibilities of Annual process, and lamented either the passivity of public opinion towards the campaign, or its constant opposition, likely with the objective not only of exonerating those guilty of the military disaster, but also of attempting to sell the colonial discourse to a population reluctant to be sent to kill and be killed in Morocco. On the other end of the spectrum, many authors who were critical of Spanish colonization in North Africa can be cited. There has been an extraordinary surge of authors critical of the events surrounding Annual, highlighting the complexities and controversies surrounding this pivotal episode, reflecting society's disagreement with colonial policy, such as Antonio Azpeitúa, Teresa de Escoriaza, Julián Besteiro, Augusto Vivero, Gómez Hidalgo, Juan Guixé, Francisco Hernández Mir or Rafael López Rienda.⁸ Following the onset of Primo

6. The debate over whether to use the term "Battle" or "Disaster" for Annual deserves special attention, which is beyond the scope of this article. Without a doubt, it is necessary to delve into an adequate categorization for the events of the summer of 1921. In the absence of specificity regarding the correct term, and to avoid potential contradictions, this article has chosen to use the word "withdrawal" in the title and refer to Annual throughout the text as neutrally as possible.

7. Francisco Bastos Ansart, *El Desastre de Annual: Melilla en julio de 1921* (Barcelona: Minerva, 1921); Alfredo Cabanillas, *La epopeya del soldado. Desde el Desastre de Annual hasta la reconquista de Monte Arruit* (Madrid: Imprenta clásica española, 1922); Ruy Goy de Silva, *Borrón y cuenta nueva. Crónicas de Marruecos* (Alcoy: s. n., 1923); Carlos Maturana Vargas, *La Trágica realidad: Marruecos* (Barcelona: Editorial Cervantes, 1921).

8. Antonio Azpeitúa, *Marruecos, la mala semilla (Ensayo de análisis objetivo de cómo fue sembrada la guerra en África)* (Madrid: Imprenta clásica española, 1921); Teresa De Escoriaza, *Del dolor de la guerra: (crónicas de la campaña de Marruecos)* (Madrid: Pueyo, 1921); Julián Besteiro, *El Partido Socialista y el problema de Marruecos* (Ciudad de México: Editorial Pablo Iglesias, 1921); Augusto Vivero, *El derrumbamiento: la verdad sobre el desastre del Rif* (Madrid: Rafael Caro Raggio, 1922); Francisco Gómez Hidalgo, *La tragedia prevista* (Madrid: Imprenta de Juan Pueyo, 1921); Juan Guixé, *El Rif en sombras. Lo que yo he visto en Melilla* (Madrid: s. n., 1922); Francisco Hernández Mir, *Del Desastre al fracaso. Un mando funesto* (Madrid: Pueyo, 1922); Rafael López Rienda, *El escándalo del millón de Larache. Datos, antecedentes y derivaciones de las inmoralidades en Marruecos* (Madrid: Sáez Hermanos, 1922); Rafael López Rienda, *Frente al fracaso.*

de Rivera's dictatorship, and particularly after the culmination of the campaign marked by the Alhucemas landing and the subjugation of the Riffians, the issue receded into the background. However, certain writers, such as Hernández Mir and José Bullejos, maintained their focus on the subject, even from their exile in Paris.⁹ Subsequently, Luis Romero Basart and Gonzalo de Reparaz delved into the topic, revisiting it during the Second Republic, wherein their discussions formed part of their broader critique of Alfonso XIII's management of the Moroccan issue.¹⁰

Throughout the Franco dictatorship, *Annual* was shrouded in silence, a deliberate effort by the regime to consign everything associated with the Spanish army's setbacks in Morocco to oblivion. Only a handful of works broached the subject during this period, and these tended to censure the role of the press in fostering criticism of the Restoration regime while extolling the military's role. Some examples include writings by Tomás García Figueras and José María Campoamor.¹¹ Additionally, there are some peripheral references in works by figures such as Maura and Fernández Almagro.¹² Examining these works briefly proves intriguing, as it reveals a peculiar yet not entirely surprising phenomenon. Many of the arguments employed by these authors to defend the actions of the Spanish Army in 1921 resurfaced in recent works of questionable academic merit, that appeared after the centenary of the events of *Annual*, as it will be seen later in this article. Notably, these post-centenary publications are predominantly authored by descendants of the same military personnel, especially the commanders and officers involved in *Annual*, suggesting a perpetuation of certain perspectives across generations.

In the waning years of the dictatorship, a cadre of authors, predominantly foreign historians, initiated a comprehensive examination of the Moroccan campaigns of the 1920s, with particular emphasis on *Annual* and its repercussions on the downfall of the Restoration regime.¹³ This marked the genesis of a research trajectory aiming to elucidate the gradual erosion of civil authority in the face of military power during the crisis of the Restoration, serving as a catalyst for the September 1923 coup. This influential trend prioritised a political-military perspective in analysing the issue, exerting a lasting impact on subsequent historiography.

Raisuni, de Silvestre a Burguete (Madrid: Sociedad General Española de Librería, 1923).

9. Francisco Hernández Mir, *Del desastre a la victoria: (1921-1926): ante las hordas del Rif* (Madrid: Librería Fernando Fe, 1926); José Bullejos, *Marruecos y la política imperialista* (París: Bureau d'Éditions, 1928).

10. Luis Romero Basart, *La guerra de Marruecos o cómo se engaña a un pueblo*, (Tetuán: Casa Gomariz, 1930); Gonzalo De Reparaz, *Alfonso XIII y sus cómplices (memorias de una las víctimas). En las que se ve lo que ha cambiado España en veinte años (1911-1931)* (Madrid: Imprenta Prensa Moderna, 1931); Gonzalo De Reparaz, *Historia de la colonización* (Barcelona: Editorial Labor, 1935).

11. Tomás García Figueras, *Historia de la acción de España en Marruecos. Desde 1904 a 1927* (Barcelona: Ediciones Fe, 1939); José María Campoamor, *La actitud de España en la cuestión de Marruecos* (Madrid: CSIC, 1951).

12. Gabriel Gamazo Maura y Melchor Fernández Almagro, *Por qué cayó Alfonso XIII* (Madrid: Ambos Mundos, 1948).

13. As the objective of this article is not to list every single work published during the XXth century in Spain that pertains to Morocco, many have regrettably been omitted. For this reason, the author of this article recommends consulting Rodolfo Gil Grimau's seminal work from the 1980s, which comprehensively compiles all publications on Morocco up to that point: Rodolfo Gil Grimau, *Aproximación a una bibliografía española sobre el Norte de África* (Madrid: Ministerio de Asuntos Exteriores, 1988).

In fact, it was during this period that discourse emerged around the onset of the Primo de Rivera dictatorship, and its close relationship (or lack thereof) with the events of Annual in 1921. Notable authors such as Stanley Payne and Carolyn Boyd, conducting studies from abroad, delved into the culmination of the Restoration regime and the influence of the colonial campaign.¹⁴ By the 1970s, a debate surfaced concerning whether Annual served as an accelerant in the regime's crisis, a thesis championed within Spanish historiography by Carlos Seco Serrano and Javier Tusell.¹⁵ Conversely, an opposing interpretation, advanced by García Venero and Raymond Carr, posited that Annual acted as the catalyst for regenerative impulses within the system.¹⁶ In subsequent years, the studies on Annual gained substantial traction, prompting historians to adopt a more comprehensive approach by delving into the intricate dynamics of the struggle between civil and military power.¹⁷ This led to a debate between those who emphasised the stimulating role played by the aftermath of Annual in the coup d'état and the weakness of the civil power as a trigger for the coup, and those who believed that Primo de Rivera's proclamation was favoured by the rebellious attitude of the army in opposition to the civil power.¹⁸

At the same time, works began to appear that touched, however tangentially, on the theme of Annual, such as the early works of Morales Lezcano, Bernabé López García and María Rosa de Madariaga.¹⁹ Nevertheless, the publication of these works marked the emergence of a less ideologically biased historiography compared to previous approaches. Undoubtedly, they represented a clear departure from the nationalist historiography that had previously dominated discussions on Spanish colonisation in Morocco, which often portrayed colonial intervention from a patriotic standpoint. Subsequently, and fortunately, this nationalist and legitimising historiography of colonial intervention found itself marginalised within academic circles since that moment, largely relegated to the realm of pseudoscientific dissemination. Following this, María del Carmen García de la Rasilla's examination of public opinion in Valladolid during the Moroccan War inaugurated a new analytical approach.²⁰ This methodology involved scrutinising

14. Stanley Payne, *Politics and the Military in Modern Spain* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1967); Carolyn Boyd, *Praetorian Politics in Liberal Spain* (North Carolina: Chapel Hill, 1979).

15. Carlos Seco Serrano, *Alfonso XIII y la crisis de la restauración* (Barcelona: Ariel, 1969); Javier Tusell, *La España del siglo XX* (Barcelona: Crítica, 1975).

16. Maximiano García Venero, *Santiago Alba, monárquico de razón* (Madrid: Aguilar, 1963); Raymond Carr, *España 1808-1939* (Barcelona: Ariel, 1969).

17. Carlos Seco Serrano, *Militarismo y civilismo en la España contemporánea* (Madrid: Instituto de Estudios Económicos, 1984); Javier Tusell, *Radiografía de un golpe de estado: el ascenso al poder del General Primo de Rivera* (Madrid: Alianza, 1987).

18. Julio Busquets, *Pronunciamientos y golpes de Estado en España*, (Madrid: Planeta, 1982); Gabriel Cardona, *El poder militar en la España contemporánea hasta la Guerra Civil* (Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1983); Manuel Ballbé, *Orden público y militarismo en la España constitucional, 1812-1983* (Madrid: Alianza, 1983); Joachim Lleixá, *100 años de militarismo en España* (Barcelona: Anagrama, 1986).

19. Víctor Morales Lezcano, *El colonialismo hispano-francés en Marruecos (1898-1927)* (Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1976); Bernabé López García, *El socialismo español y el anticolonialismo (1898-1914)* (Madrid: Cuadernos para el Diálogo (suplemento), 1976); María Rosa De Madariaga, "Le Parti socialiste espagnol et le Parti communiste d'Espagne face à la révolte rifaine," in *VVAA: Abd-el-Krim et la République du Rif* (Paris: François Maspero, 1976), 308-66.

20. María del Carmen García de la Rasilla Ortega, *Los problemas de Marruecos y la opinión pública*

the local press of a specific location and comparing it with the national press, an avenue of investigation that has proven highly fruitful in recent years, as it will be seen later. It is also worth mentioning one of the first works dedicated to the study of public opinion and Annual, by Celso Almuiña.²¹

This was followed by the doctoral thesis on the Annual events by Pablo La Porte, an author who marked an epoch as a pioneer in the study of the subject, establishing new hypotheses that have been followed up by numerous authors.²² According to La Porte, upon the arrival of news about Annual in the summer of 1921, instead of witnessing riots or intense criticism, the Spanish population supported the government. This support was driven by the magnitude of the events, sparking a wave of patriotic fervour across practically all Spanish cities. However, this backing dissipated by the year's end when the campaign's objectives and the rescue of prisoners remained unfulfilled. Subsequently, the Spanish population demanded accountability for the disaster, creating an atmosphere of criticism and tension that ultimately facilitated the rise of the Primo de Rivera dictatorship.

Undoubtedly, Pablo La Porte's thesis on why the Spanish did not react to the so-called Disaster in 1921 in the same way as they did to the Barranco del Lobo in 1909 has influenced many subsequent studies. Javier Ramiro de la Mata, for example, later highlighted the differences between the attitudes of Spaniards in 1909 and 1921, noting first the lack of interest in exploiting the new territories beyond the Straits. However, once immersed in the atmosphere of conquest, he observed that Spanish public opinion moved between a dualism of euphoria and tragedy.²³

During this period, more notable works emerged, delving into various political sectors' attitudes toward the Annual events.²⁴ María Rosa de Madariaga's doctoral thesis, alongside the contributions of Manuel Leguineche and Juan Pando

Vallisoletana (1898-1927) (Memoria de Licenciatura, Universidad de Valladolid, 1985); María del Carmen García de la Rasilla Ortega, "Palencia y la guerra de Marruecos (1909-1927)" en *VVAA: Actas del I Congreso de Historia de Palencia. Tomo III. Edad Moderna y edad Contemporánea* (Palencia: Diputación Provincial de Palencia, 1987): 715-723.

21. Celso Almuiña, "El Desastre de Annual (1921): su proyección sobre la opinión pública española," *Investigaciones Históricas* 8 (1988): 181-245.

22. Pablo La Porte, *El Desastre de Annual y la crisis de la Restauración en España (1921-1923)* (Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 1997). Later developed in Pablo La Porte, *La atracción del imán. El Desastre de Annual y sus repercusiones en la política europea (1921-1923)* (Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2001) and Pablo La Porte, "Marruecos y la crisis de la Restauración, 1917-1923," *Ayer* 63 (2006): 53-74.

The author himself conducted a historiographical assessment of Annual in 1997, asserting, even then, contrary to what traditional historiography suggested, that Annual and its political consequences had been thoroughly investigated. In Pablo La Porte, "El desastre de Annual, ¿un olvido historiográfico?," *Cuadernos de historia contemporánea* 19 (1997): 223-30.

23. Javier Ramiro de la Mata, *Origen y dinámica del colonialismo español en Marruecos* (Ceuta: Ciudad Autónoma de Ceuta, 2001).

24. Antonio Moreno Juste, "El Socialista y el Desastre de Annual: opinión y actitud socialista ante la derrota," *Cuadernos de Historia Contemporánea* 12 (1990): 103-32; Margarita Caballero Domínguez, "La cuestión marroquí y su corolario de Añual como causa y consecuencia de la crisis del sistema restauracionista," *Investigaciones históricas: Época moderna y contemporánea* 17 (1997): 219-42; María Rosa De Madariaga, "Nacionalismos vasco y catalán frente a la revolución de Abd-el-Krim," *Historia* 16, Año XXII, 268 (1998): 69-77.

on the events of 1921, stood out as significant publications from these years.²⁵ Also worth mentioning is Sebastian Balfour's *Deadly Embrace*, whose main aim was to link the genesis of the Africanist military in Morocco and its subsequent relationship with the outbreak and brutalisation of the Spanish Civil War.²⁶ A notable aspect of the works of Madariaga, Leguineche, and Balfour is the tremendous effort they made to incorporate the perspective of the Moroccans, particularly the Riffians, a perspective that is notably scarce in the entire bibliographic corpus discussed in this article. These authors conducted interviews with survivors of the colonial campaigns or their descendants (even with relatives of Abd el Krim), allowing them to amplify the voices of the often-overlooked participants in the conflict. In the case of Sebastian Balfour, this approach unveiled an aspect rarely discussed in Spanish historiography: the use of chemical gases by the Spanish army against the Riffian civilian population.

Simultaneously, it is imperative to acknowledge the extensive body of work produced by the prolific Eloy Martín Corrales, particularly his significant contribution, *La imagen del magrebí en España: una perspectiva histórica: siglos XVI-XX*.²⁷ Across these and subsequent works, Martín Corrales expounds on the notion that Annual acted as a catalyst in the struggle among various political forces. These forces recognised the utility of the African defeat as a political weapon to expose the inefficiency of the Madrid government. Additionally, he underscores the profound impact that images of the corpses of the massacre of Monte Arruit had on Spanish society. According to Martín Corrales, the sight of thousands of tortured and mutilated bodies elucidates why Spanish anti-colonial sentiment, which had steadily intensified since 1909, eventually gave way to a genuine thirst for revenge that permeated almost all Spanish society.²⁸ At the same time, María Rosa de Madariaga argued that it was the republican sectors, and above all the socialists, who opposed any military adventure that could lead to loss of life and waste of public funds. She also argued that there was a certain lethargy in public opinion from Annual until the beginning of 1922, when harsh criticism of politicians and the military would begin.²⁹

25. María Rosa De Madariaga, *España y el Rif. Crónica de una historia casi olvidada* (Melilla: La Biblioteca de Melilla, 1999); Manuel Leguineche, *Annual, el desastre de España en el Rif* (Madrid: Alfaguara, 1996); Juan Pando, *Historia secreta de Annual* (Madrid: Temas de Hoy, 1999).

26. Sebastian Balfour, *Abrazo mortal. De la guerra colonial a la Guerra Civil en España y Marruecos (1909-1939)* (Barcelona: Península, 2002). The same author had already made some incursions into the topic of public opinion and colonial problems in Sebastian Balfour, *El fin del imperio español (1898-1923)* (Barcelona: Crítica, 1995).

27. Eloy Martín Corrales, *La imagen del magrebí en España: una perspectiva histórica: siglos XVI-XX* (Barcelona: Bellaterra, 2002); Eloy Martín Corrales, "El cine español y las guerras de Marruecos (1896-1994)," *Hispania: Revista española de historia* 55, 190 (1995): 693-708.

28. Eloy Martín Corrales, "Las guerras de Marruecos y la opinión pública española: 1859-1958," in *La guerra de Marruecos y la España de su tiempo*, ed. Francisco Alía Miranda (Ciudad Real: Sociedad Don Quijote, 2009), 135-52.

29. María Rosa De Madariaga, *En el Barranco del Lobo. Las guerras de Marruecos* (Madrid: Alianza, 2005). By the same author, idea developed in later works: María Rosa De Madariaga, *Marruecos, ese gran desconocido: breve historia del protectorado español* (Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 2013); María Rosa De Madariaga, *Los moros que trajo Franco* (Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 2015).

Since the beginning of the XXIst century, there has been a notable upsurge in scholarly work on Annual, with a marked expansion in the range of topics studied within the field. Increased scholarly attention has been paid to the realm of public opinion, and to the reactions of the Spanish people to the events.³⁰ As a result, the study of public opinion has been approached from a multidisciplinary perspective, including fields such as journalism. In this sense, scholars have not only studied public opinion as a primary focus of investigation but have also examined it in different geographical and chronological contexts, using new and diverse sources of analysis.³¹ These investigations have provided interesting perspectives on the transmission of information between the Protectorate and the Peninsula, a vital aspect for the Restoration regime, obsessed with censoring the news that came from Morocco.³²

In fact, some of the most informative essays on the public impact of Moroccan conflicts have been published by journalists in recent decades. Of particular significance are contributions that shed light on censorship and disinformation strategies. These essays explore the challenges journalists faced in conveying information from North Africa.³³ From these works, it is evident that there were institutional efforts to promote colonial consensus in public opinion through a network of propagandists financed by public funds, known as “slush funds.”³⁴ Furthermore, notable contributions, such as those by José Manuel Morales Tamaral, analyse the legislative and institutional framework that established the groundwork for censorship and propaganda mechanisms. Morales Tamaral argues that Spaniards learned to censor and manipulate information in Morocco, particularly following the events of the 1921 Annual.³⁵

Another field of study related to the Protectorate and Annual that has received notable attention is the examination of Africanism and its implications for Spanish society. This includes tracing the evolution from civilist postulates of the late XIXth century to militaristic positions leading up to the Civil War. During the colonial period, Africanism had a prevalent influence, as scholars like Vicente Moga have shown.³⁶ Margarita Barral has also made significant contributions to the

30. María Ángeles Recio García, “El desastre de Annual en el Parlamento español: las Comisiones de Responsabilidades,” *Revista Digital de Guerra Colonial* 2 (2018): 61-78.

31. Enrique Bordería Ortiz y Antonio Laguna Platero, “Al servicio del imperio. Estrategias de desinformación en la guerra del norte de África,” in *Comunicación y guerra en la historia*, ed. Alberto Pena (Santiago de Compostela, Tórculo Edicions, 2004), 663-82; Inmaculada Rius Sanchís y Francesc Andreu Martínez Gallego, “Los lápices rojos del africanismo: control informativo en la guerra de Marruecos,” in *Comunicación y guerra en la historia*, ed. Alberto Pena (Santiago de Compostela, Tórculo Edicions, 2004), 825-850.

32. Antonio Rubio Campaña, *Periodistas españoles en la guerra del Rif: 1921-1923. Origen del periodismo de investigación en España* (Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2005).

33. Antonio García Palomares, *El origen del periodismo de guerra actual en España: el análisis de los corresponsales en el conflicto del norte de África entre 1893 y 1925* (Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2014).

34. Francesc Andreu Martínez Gallego y Antonio Laguna Platero, “Comunicación, propaganda y censura en la guerra hispanomarroquí (1906-1923),” *Comunicación y Sociedad* 27.3 (2014): 43-63.

35. José Manuel Morales Tamaral, “A la conquista de las masas. Los orígenes de la propaganda estatal en la España de entreguerras, 1917-1936,” *Rúbrica Contemporánea* 5/10 (2016): 65-83.

36. Vicente Moga Romero, *La cuestión marroquí en la escritura africanista una aproximación a la contribución*

understanding of Africanism as an instrument of Spanish nationalism at the turn of the XXth century.³⁷ David Parra has built on the Africanist tradition of Joaquín Costa to explore the genesis of military Africanism.³⁸ He concludes that the Moroccan War played a pivotal role in shaping concepts of identity through the construction of an external “other.” This transitioned discourse from notions of civilisational superiority to a stance of vengeance following military defeats.

However, when discussing the study of Africanism, the works of Daniel Macías are indispensable. Macías reconstructs the origins and development of the military caste through a meticulous analysis of both theoretical frameworks articulated by the military themselves and their practices in Morocco.³⁹ He argues that the formation of the military caste of the Africanists was influenced by the widespread opposition of Spanish public opinion to intervention in Morocco. This opposition, which originated from dissatisfaction with campaigns in Morocco, led to the formation of a colonial army consisting of volunteer shock troops and the use of indigenous forces under the guidance of Spanish officers.

In the following years, there has been what could be described as a “boom” in publications that examine the impact of the Moroccan Wars, and especially the events of Annual of 1921, through the lens of local history. It is important, however, to distinguish between publications that focus exclusively on a particular city or province and those that seek to conduct a case-study analysis with the aim of extrapolating broader implications for the Spanish nation. In the first category, notable contributions to the study of Spanish public opinion and the Moroccan colonial campaign have come from places such as Gijón,⁴⁰ Álava,⁴¹ Albacete,⁴² Salamanca,⁴³ Canarias,⁴⁴ Ciudad Real,⁴⁵ Zaragoza⁴⁶ and

bibliográfica y editorial española al conocimiento del norte de Marruecos (1859-2006) (Barcelona: Bellaterra, 2008).

37. Margarita Barral Martínez, “El africanismo como instrumento del nacionalismo español a principios del siglo XX: la Conferencia de Algeciras,” *Jerónimo Zurita* 88 (2013): 275-295.

38. David Parra Monserrat, *La narrativa del africanismo franquista: génesis y prácticas socio-educativas* (Tesis doctoral inédita, Universitat de Valencia, 2012).

39. Daniel Macías Fernández: *Franco “nació en África”: Los africanistas y las Campañas de Marruecos* (Madrid: Tecnos, 2019).

Daniel Macías Fernández y María Gajate Bajo, “Ni contigo ni sin ti: la africanidad en el discurso de los militares africanistas (1909-1927),” *El Futuro del Pasado: revista electrónica de historia* 14 (2023): 377-408.

40. Luis Arias González. “El sentimiento popular ante la guerra de Marruecos,” in *Historia militar de Asturias*, ed. José Girón Garrote (Oviedo: Silverio Cañada, 2006), 116-34.

41. Germán Ruiz Llano, “Álava ante el Desastre de Annual,” *Estudios Alaveses* 32 (2010): 145-66.

42. Enrique Cerro Aguilar, *Camino de Annual. Albacete y el Desastre de 1921* (Albacete: Instituto de Estudios Albacetenses “Don Juan Manuel,” 2007).

43. María Gajate Bajo: “La Guerra de Marruecos en una ciudad del interior Salamanca, de Annual al golpe de estado,” *Revista de historia militar* 104 (2008): 73-138.

44. Jesús Martínez Milán y Jennifer Guerra Hernández, “El desastre de Annual a través de la prensa canaria: una breve introducción,” *Boletín de la Real Sociedad Económica de Amigos del País de Tenerife* 1 (2010): 377-92.

45. Mariano García-Consuegra, *Los aviones del pueblo: el aeroplano “Ciudad Real”* (Ciudad Real: Diputación Provincial de Ciudad Real, 2015).

46. Alfonso Bermúdez Mombiela, “¡Abajo la guerra! Aproximaciones a la oposición a la guerra del Rif en la Zaragoza de principios del siglo XX (1909-1923),” *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 5.10 (2016): 264-82; Alfonso Bermúdez Mombiela, “El Desastre de Annual y la ciudad de Zaragoza,” in *Guerra del Rif. Cien años después. XV Jornadas nacionales de historia militar. Cátedra General Castaños*, coord. Leandro Álvarez

Toledo.⁴⁷ In the latter group, some authors have begun their research with a specific locality as a case study, but have subsequently broadened their scope to offer insights into the wider ramifications of Spanish colonisation in Morocco and its impact in the face of military setbacks. Notable works in this area include those by Jennifer Hernández, who offers perspectives from the Canary Islands,⁴⁸ and Alfonso Bermúdez, whose analyses focus on the case of Zaragoza.⁴⁹ In the case of this author, his analysis attempts to adopt a bidirectional approach aimed at resolving the typical challenge of distinguishing between public opinion and published opinion. To do so, he combines the analysis of speeches from power establishments with a transnational comparative perspective.⁵⁰ At the same time, a social history approach is integrated, examining popular demonstrations – primarily orchestrated by soldiers’ mothers – and delving into statistics on insubordination and desertion in military recruitment, drawn from military archives.⁵¹

Also starting from the local perspective, but with a general will, it is imperative to acknowledge the contributions of historian María Gajate, who has amassed a distinguished career in recent years. Following an exhaustive examination of public opinion in Salamanca concerning the colonial campaigns, Gajate has formulated a theory positing that Spanish public sentiment towards the Moroccan war campaigns was not uniformly oppositional, nor universally supportive; rather, a prevailing sense of traditional indifference, and at times resignation, permeated.⁵² Through her analyses of public opinion across various works, coupled with insights gleaned from soldiers’ experiences, Gajate has concluded that periods of tranquillity between campaigns were of paramount importance. These interludes provided respite for the most marginalised social strata, which tended to disengage from complex international matters and sought to maintain a distance from their Moroccan counterparts.⁵³

Rey, Álvaro Gómez Porrúa y José Leonardo Ruiz Sánchez (Sevilla: Editorial Universidad de Sevilla, 2023), 305-26.

47. Irene González González, “El papel social de la prensa en tiempo de conflicto: la provincia de Toledo y el desastre de Annual,” in Conference in *XXV Encuentro del FIMAM* (Foro de Investigación sobre Mundo Árabe y Musulmán), 16/11/2023.

48. Jennifer Guerra Hernández, *El impacto de la Guerra de Marruecos en Canarias (1909-1927)* (Tesis doctoral, Universidad de las Palmas de Gran Canaria, 2016); Jennifer Guerra Hernández, *Canarias ante la Guerra de Marruecos (1909-1927). Miradas desde el Atlántico* (Las Palmas de Gran Canaria: Editorial Cabildo Insular de Gran Canaria, 2020).

49. Alfonso Bermúdez Mombiela, *Colonialismo español a principios del siglo XX. El impacto de las guerras de marruecos en Zaragoza (1906-1927)* (Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidad de Zaragoza, 2021).

50. Alfonso Bermúdez Mombiela, “Colonial Wars and Public Opinion in a Comparative Perspective,” in *Examining colonial wars and their impact on contemporary military history*, eds. Miguel Madueño Álvarez and Alberto Guerrero Martín (IGI Global, 2023), 1-19.

51. Alfonso Bermúdez Mombiela, “Voluntarios y conscriptos. Una comparativa del uso de tropas coloniales a nivel europeo y el caso español,” in *Combatientes en las guerras coloniales*, eds. Miguel Madueño Álvarez y Pedro Panera Martínez (Madrid: Dykinson, 2023), 11-24.

52. María Gajate Bajo, *Las campañas de Marruecos y la opinión pública: el ejemplo de Salamanca y su prensa* (Madrid: Instituto universitario general Gutiérrez Mellado, 2012).

53. María Gajate Bajo, “El desastre de Annual. El pleito de las responsabilidades en la gran prensa (1921-1923),” *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 3 (2013): 119-138; María Gajate Bajo, “El Protectorado, las campañas hispano-marroquíes y la opinión pública (1902-1923),” *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 8, 16 (2019): 82-103; María Gajate Bajo, “Las campañas de Marruecos y la opinión pública. Una puesta al día,” *Hispania* 79/263 (2019): 727-56.

On a contrasting note, examining Spanish public opinion not solely through a localised lens but from a national perspective, it is imperative to highlight the monumental contributions of Alfonso Iglesias, widely regarded as the foremost authority in contemporary studies of the Moroccan wars of the early XXth century. In his doctoral thesis, subsequently published as a book, Iglesias undertook an exhaustive analysis not only of historical newspapers but also embraced a multidisciplinary approach that incorporated sources from literature, photography, postcards, theatre, cinema, and even commemorative monuments.⁵⁴ His aim was to construct a comprehensive portrayal of the impact of Spanish colonisation in North Africa on the Iberian Peninsula. Consequently, his work is distinguished by its holistic approach to the subject matter. In subsequent years, Iglesias has continued to delve into new topics, ranging from military history and nationalism to the importance of collective memory about the years of the Spanish Protectorate in Morocco.⁵⁵

Both Gajate and Iglesias have made substantial contributions to the progression of knowledge and Spanish historiography concerning the Protectorate and the events of Annual. Furthermore, they have curated review dossiers that convened various experts on the subject, in 2019, with an interesting contribution from the American Hispanist Geoffrey Jensen and, notably, after the Annual Centennial, in 2022.⁵⁶ These initiatives have served to catalyse scholarly discourse and deepen our understanding of this fundamental period in Spanish history.

On a different note, one of the most innovative and promising perspectives to emerge in recent years has undoubtedly been within the framework of cultural, gender and postcolonial studies, epitomised by the scholarly contributions of Gemma Torres. Her research examines the masculine archetypes pervasive in Spanish colonial discourse, encompassing representations of both Spanish and Moroccan masculinity. Using diverse sources such as travel literature, treatises describing Moroccan landscapes, journalistic narratives, visual representations, popular fiction, and personal testimonies of soldiers, Torres examines the complex interplay between gender archetypes and the construction of collective identities amid Spanish colonial efforts in Morocco.⁵⁷ According to Torres, representations of masculinity served to

54. Alfonso Iglesias Amorín, *La memoria de las Guerras de Marruecos en España (1859-1936)* (Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidade de Santiago de Compostela, 2015); Alfonso Iglesias Amorín, *Marruecos, panteón del Imperio español (1859-1931)* (Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2022).

55. Alfonso Iglesias Amorín, “La evolución de la imagen de las guerras de Marruecos y su difusión en la opinión pública (1859-1927),” *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 8.16 (2019): 104-31; Alfonso Iglesias Amorín, “The Hispano-Moroccan Wars (1859-1927) and the (De)nationalization of the Spanish People,” *European History Quarterly* 50, 2 (2020): 290-310; Alfonso Iglesias Amorín y Rocio Velasco de Castro, “La Guerra del Rif (1921-1926) y las memorias conflictivas entre España y Marruecos,” *Memoria Y Civilización* 26.2 (2023): 101-23.

56. Alfonso Iglesias Amorín, “Dossier: España y Marruecos guerra y colonialismo en los siglos XIX y XX,” *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 8, 16 (2019); Geoffrey Jensen, “The Spanish-Moroccan Military Campaigns in the Context of European Colonial History,” *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 8, 16 (2019): 17-40; María Gajate Bajo y Alfonso Iglesias Amorín, A. “Dossier: Annual, 1921: el desastre que cambió a un país,” *Studia historica. Historia contemporánea* 39 (2022).

57. Gemma Torres Delgado, *Masculinitat i colonització a Espanya: arquetips masculins al discurs colonial sobre el Marroc (1880-1927)*, (Tesis doctoral, Universitat de Barcelona, 2016); Gemma Torres Delgado, “La nación viril. Imágenes masculinas de España en el africanismo reaccionario después de la derrota de Annual

reinforce the hierarchical relationship between the two nations, with Spain depicted as the civilising force and Morocco relegated to a position of decadence and backwardness – a stark antithesis to Spain’s desired self-image.⁵⁸

Subsequently, the Annual Centennial deserves recognition for its contribution to the development of historiography surrounding this pivotal episode. Contrary to the misconception that little has been written about Annual, the Centennial revealed that Annual has been the subject of continuous analysis and study over the years. This culminated in a peak of scholarly attention on the occasion of the centenary of the Spanish defeat. In coincidence with the anniversary commemoration, several conferences, symposiums, exhibitions, articles, and books were organised and published, all focused on the events of July-August 1921. At the same time, it is necessary to mention that the centenary commemoration of the events of Annual precipitated a surge in publications originating from military institutions, some of them authored by descendants of the commanders and officers who were present in the Protectorate during the 1920s and 1930s. For those influenced by the military ethos, it is clear that Annual remains an open wound and a blemish in the annals of the Spanish Army’s history. Thus, regrettably, many of these publications suffer from a discernible deficit in quality. While they provide valuable insights into the military campaigns in Morocco, they tend to excessively emphasise technical and tactical aspects, albeit of scientific interest. However, alongside these technical contributions, there exists a pronounced tendency towards negative and biased value judgments regarding the Moroccan response to what was undeniably an invasion of their territory. Works that, without making a novel contribution or significant interpretation, reinforce stereotypes, stories and historiographic trends that were supposed to be already in decline.

Furthermore, concerning the events of Annual, these publications often adopt a rhetoric of absolute exoneration for military commanders, particularly Generals Silvestre, Berenguer, and Navarro, as well as King Alfonso XIII, assigning sole responsibility to the politicians of the Restoration and the leftist parties. Such rhetoric lacks introspection and is inherently perilous, given the presentist implications that can be extrapolated from it. As most of these publications are informative rather than academic, this article will focus on just two books – the only ones with a certain academic will – as an exemplar of this rhetoric. The book *A cien años de Annual*, presents a unique challenge for researchers as it encapsulates the ongoing struggle between scientifically sound and rigorous contributions and those that are, at best, dubious.⁵⁹ Despite successfully assembling leading specialists

(1921-1927),” *Ayer* 106.2 (2017):133-58; Gemma Torres Delgado, “La reivindicación de la nación civilizada: masculinidad española en el discurso colonial sobre Marruecos (1900-1927),” *Cuadernos De Historia Contemporánea* 39 (2017): 59-81.

58. Gemma Torres Delgado, “Emociones viriles y la experiencia de la nación imperial en las Guerras del Rif (1909-1927),” *Studia historica. Historia contemporánea* 38 (2020): 99-127; Gemma Torres Delgado, *La virilitat d’Espanya a l’Àfrica. Nació i masculinitat al colonialisme al Marroc (1880-1927)* (Barcelona: Afers, 2020).

59. Daniel Macías Fernández (ed), *A cien años de Annual. La guerra de Marruecos* (Madrid: Desperta Ferro Ediciones, 2021).

on the subject, including luminaries such as María Rosa de Madariaga in one of her final contributions, the book also contains contributions that reflect presentist conceptions. This is an indulgence that rigorous academic historiography cannot afford. Additionally, as a collective work, the book suffers from a notable disparity in contributions, rendering it somewhat unbalanced.

A similar issue arises upon examining the book *Guerra del Rif. Cien años después. XV Jornadas nacionales de historia militar*, jointly edited by the General Castaños Chair, a military institution, and the University of Seville.⁶⁰ This collaborative effort between the university and the military stemmed from a conference commemorating the Annual Centennial in November 2021. The book aimed to bring together researchers from both academic and military realms, but the outcome was even more imbalanced than the previously cited book. Although the book contains some compelling chapters, particularly concerning the technical aspects of warfare, it lacks self-criticism regarding the military's role in the so-called "Disaster." Furthermore, Moroccans are often depicted in a negative light as uncivilized and ungrateful savages, rather than as individuals who bravely defended their homeland against an invading army.

The potential imbalance is a risk that any collaborative work is vulnerable to, as also demonstrated by the book *Annual. Ecos de la última aventura colonial española*.⁶¹ This volume includes contributions from esteemed authors, such as Eloy Martín Corrales; however, it struggles with coherence and structure among its various chapters. Indeed, out of the 18 chapters, only three appropriately address the topic of Annual, with several contributions veering off-topic entirely. As an example in contrast, the review *Hispania Nova* published a specialised dossier on the Annual events, which was more structured, balanced, and academically interesting.⁶² This dossier, led by Rocío Velasco, is one of the best examples of the direction that historiography should take when dealing with the events of Annual. Along with the dossier coordinated by María Gajate and Alfonso Iglesias in *Studia Historica*, it serves as a beacon of scholarly production in its comprehensive approach and interdisciplinary collaboration. These two projects have brought together academic experts from different fields, including historians, Arabists, anthropologists and, notably, the participation of a Moroccan historian such as Mohamed Abrighach, an extremely rare occurrence in Spanish academic publications.⁶³ Such collaborations demonstrate the potential for enriched perspectives and deeper insights when scholarship transcends disciplinary boundaries and embraces diverse voices and perspectives.

60. Leandro Álvarez Rey, Álvaro Gómez Porrúa y José Leonardo Ruiz Sánchez (coord.), *Guerra del Rif. Cien años después. XV Jornadas nacionales de historia militar. Cátedra General Castaños* (Sevilla: Editorial Universidad de Sevilla, 2023).

61. Bruno Camus Bergareche y Anna Scicolone (eds). *Annual. Ecos de la última aventura colonial española* (Madrid: Catarata, 2021).

62. Rocío Velasco de Castro, "Dossier: España y Marruecos: del desastre de Annual a la dictadura de Primo de Rivera (1921-1930)," *Hispania Nova* 20 (2022).

63. Mohammed Abrighach, "España y la batalla de Annual en El poema de Dhar Oubarran. (Epopéya poética rifeña de 1921)," *Studia historica. Historia contemporánea* 39 (2022): 73-92.

In this regard, it is fair to make a small aside and mention the Moroccan authors who have contributed to the study of relations between Spain and Morocco, as well as to the understanding of the Annual episode, since one of the aims of this article is to promote knowledge exchange and collaboration between Spanish and Moroccan historiographies. Although these authors are often cited or known by Spanish scholars, they have not received the recognition they deserve in our historiographical landscape. For instance, one of the most frequently cited works is Tayeb Boutbouqalt's *La Guerre du Rif et la réaction de l'opinion internationale, 1921-1926*, which was published in the 1990s and pioneered the study of public opinion and the Rif War.⁶⁴ Moreover, Youssef Akmir's works, which demonstrate extensive knowledge of the Protectorate period and the political, economic, and social implications of Moroccan colonization by Spain, should also be acknowledged.⁶⁵ Moreover, Mimoun Aziza's contributions are noteworthy.⁶⁶ Professor Aziza has analysed the impact of Spanish colonization on the Riffian population, providing insights into the various attitudes adopted by the colonized towards the Spanish invasion, ranging from resigned acceptance to enthusiastic collaboration and armed resistance.

Returning to Spanish historiography, it is important to emphasize the exceptional yet underrecognized work of Diego Victoria within the context of publications that emerged during the Annual Centennial.⁶⁷ Although not a specialist in the field of Spanish colonisation of Morocco, Victoria's book provides a compelling and insightful read. The author's comprehensive analysis of the issue, supported by a rigorous use of sources, is enhanced by a necessary reflection on the legacy of Annual to this day. In addition, the recently published book *La correspondencia de Annual*, written by Carmen Marchante, must be mentioned for its great value as a primary source.⁶⁸ The book is a transcription of a fascinating collection of previously unknown letters written by the relatives of the soldiers, offering a poignant insight into the turbulent and tragic days that followed the events of the summer of 1921.

However, most of these publications, with few exceptions, still struggle with a fundamental issue: unidirectionality. Although many of these works aim to analyse how Spain was influenced by the colonial endeavour, a perspective from the other side of the Strait could offer significant advancements in our understanding

64. Tayeb Boutbouqalt, *La Guerre du Rif et la réaction de l'opinion internationale, 1921-1926* (Casablanca: Najah El Jadida, 1992).

65. Youssef Akmir, "La conciencia colectiva española frente a las guerras coloniales del norte de Marruecos (1909-1921)," *Norba. Revista de Historia* 29-30 (2016-2017): 69-85.

Youssef Akmir, "De la potencia invasora a la potencia protectora. La percepción de España en el norte de Marruecos (1860-1923)," *Awraq: Estudios sobre el mundo árabe e islámico contemporáneo* 5-6 (2012): 157-76.

66. Mimoun Aziza, *La sociedad rifeña frente al Protectorado español de Marruecos (1912-1956)* (Barcelona: Ediciones Bellaterra, 2003); Mimoun Aziza, *España y el Rif, miradas cruzadas* (Madrid: Diwan Mayrit, 2023).

67. Diego Victoria Moreno, *Dolor y vergüenza: el recuerdo de Annual (1921). El fracaso político-militar en el Protectorado Español de Marruecos* (Cartagena: Ediciones Nova Spartaria, 2021).

68. Carmen Marchante Moralejo, *La correspondencia de Annual. Escritos de familiares de soldados y oficiales en las posiciones de la Comandancia General de Melilla al Ministerio de la Guerra. Estudio preliminar y edición comentada de los textos* (Melilla: UNED. Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia, 2023).

of the subject. Though, some authors have addressed this aspect; one of the authors involved in this endeavour is, undeniably, Rocío Velasco, a seasoned expert on the Moroccan historiographical landscape. Through her work, Velasco has consistently sought to bridge the gap and bring scholarly production to the other side of the Strait of Gibraltar.⁶⁹ Moreover, the perception of the Moroccan population towards the invasion of Spanish troops has been largely neglected in Spanish historiography. In this sense, Jorge Martínez Reverte's book, published in the Centennial year, is a notable exception.⁷⁰ It represents a significant effort to address the impact of the colonial campaign on the Rif population by drawing upon native sources. Indeed, Martínez Reverte's work represents a commendable exercise in historical empathy for the Riffians, a perspective that has been notably scarce in studies concerning the Moroccan Wars. This dearth reflects the colonial and Eurocentric mentality that has often permeated Spanish historiography. By offering a nuanced portrayal of the experiences and perspectives of the Rif population, Martínez Reverte's work challenges conventional narratives and enriches our understanding of this complex historical period.

Undoubtedly, exploring the Spanish bibliography on the Protectorate in Morocco, specifically the Annual episode of the summer of 1921, requires more attention and length than can be accommodated in a single article. The aim of this contribution was to offer reflections, albeit somewhat tangential, on the publications in Spain related to our neighbouring country, within a more chronologically restricted timeframe. Due to the large volume of articles and chapters published in scientific journals, collective books, and conference proceedings, some works had to be left out. Considering the inevitable omissions that have occurred in this historiographic review, the author of this article must extend the sincerest apologies to those whose contributions have not been mentioned.

It is evident that historiography on Morocco has made significant strides in terms of quality. Moreover, as observed, there are tentative steps being taken to integrate Moroccan historiography into broader analyses. Furthermore, there is a growing trend within historiography to move beyond mere political history and instead focus on the social and cultural aspects of the impact of Spanish colonisation in Morocco. However, it is concerning to note that a significant portion of the publications related to the Centennial of Annual lack quality and scientific rigor. This bibliography is often marked by ideological bias and nationalist inspiration and fails to offer a reasonable and reasoned perspective on Spanish-Moroccan relations throughout history, particularly the events of the Disaster or Battle of Annual. It is concerning that works of this nature

69. Among her many works: Rocío Velasco de Castro, "La lucha anti-colonial en el protectorado español según la historiografía marroquí: Raisuni y Abdelkrim," *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 8, 16 (2019): 41-60; Rocío Velasco de Castro, "En torno al centenario de Annual: Abdelkrim y la resistencia armada contra el colonialismo español," in *En la Europa liberal: el deber y la compasión*, coord. Enrique San Miguel Pérez (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 2021), 145-70; Rocío Velasco de Castro, "Percepciones del Protectorado español y su legado: lengua, cultura y literatura españolas en el Marruecos postcolonial," *Historia del presente* 41 (2023): 11-26.

70. Jorge Martínez Reverte, *El vuelo de los buitres: El desastre de Annual y la guerra del Rif* (Barcelona: Galaxia Gutenberg, 2021).

attempt to perpetuate a vision of Spain under attack and threatened from the south, in an effort to justify Spanish colonial rule in Morocco.

Conclusion

All things considered, it can be said that Spanish historiography concerning the history of Morocco and the Protectorate, as well as the events of Annual in 1921, has exhibited notable advancements both in terms of quality and, notably, quantity. There has been a gradual incorporation of analyses encompassing Morocco, with dedicated attention to its political, economic, social, and cultural evolution, alongside certain insights about its inhabitants. This inclusivity contributes significantly to fostering a more objective, critical, and empathetic comprehension of Spain and Morocco's historical trajectory. Undeniably, Spanish historiography has made commendable strides over the past five decades. Likewise, the centenary of what Spanish historiography denotes as the Annual Disaster, and Moroccan historiography terms as the Battle of Annual, has spurred a proliferation of scholarly works on this subject. Some exhibit commendable quality, while others are of a more dubious nature, collectively expanding the breadth of research.

After reviewing the current state of Spanish historiography on the Protectorate and the events of Annual, it is clear that academic interest in Spain's colonial past remains strong. The large number of scholarly works and the variety of historians cited in this article demonstrate the enduring relevance and scholarly vitality of this field. The research in this area has the potential to occupy a prominent position within contemporary Spanish academia. However, despite the wealth of expertise and scholarship within the discipline, it continues to be marginalised within hegemonic academic circles. This discrepancy between the richness of scholarship and its recognition within mainstream academia requires further scrutiny. Therefore, upon reflection, it becomes apparent that there exists a necessity to redouble efforts aimed at enhancing the quality and quantity of historiography not only about Annual but the history of the Protectorate in general. A departure from traditional military themes and conquest narratives is imperative, with a renewed focus on perpetuating the most promising research avenues or venturing into novel thematic territories. Despite the fruitful progression of historiography in recent years, notably driven by the interest of a new generation of youthful researchers in innovative theoretical approaches, substantial limitations persist and warrant attention.

A critical re-evaluation of Spanish colonial historiography is imperative, with conventional topics such as military campaign narratives or the perspectives of political parties and social movements on colonialism assuming a secondary role to a new historiography prioritising identity, history of emotions, mindsets, ideologies, women, everyday life, and memory places. This paradigmatic shift in research must aim to invigorate and revitalise the academic domain of colonial studies. Emerging historians should explore novel approaches that transcend existing constraints to illuminate the contradictions within a colonial past too frequently overlooked or rejected by collective consciousness.

To conclude, the Spanish historiography of colonialism in Morocco, particularly pertaining to the events of Annual in 1921, encounters two additional challenges to escape the academic marginalisation it currently faces. First, a significant hurdle lies in the limited communication between Spanish and Moroccan historians, creating a one-sided mirror effect, as noted at the outset of this article. This deficiency underscores the imperative for heightened cross-cultural dialogue and collaboration to achieve a more comprehensive and nuanced understanding of the shared history between Spain and Morocco. Undoubtedly, incorporating the perspectives and experiences of the so-called “Other” would significantly enhance the narrative, leading to a more objective, critical, and empathetic understanding of Morocco and Moroccans. By acknowledging and integrating diverse viewpoints, historiography could strive to offer a more comprehensive and nuanced portrayal of historical events, fostering empathy and understanding across cultural boundaries. This approach not only would enrich our understanding of the past but also promote greater mutual respect and appreciation in the present.

Second, this historiography must firmly establish itself within the hegemonic academic sphere, actively participating with its own voice in scientific conferences, and attracting new researchers capable of delivering innovative and compelling contributions to the field of study. As demonstrated in this article, there are numerous experts in this field of study, spanning various disciplines, who can elevate the historiography on the Protectorate to the level it deserves. Indeed, when these experts have collaborated, the results have yielded notable academic value, enabling to combat presentist conceptions originating from pseudoscientific fields. Therefore, it is essential for current experts in the field to establish productive networks of contact and collaboration, aimed at valuing studies on the shared past of Spaniards and Moroccans. Such collaborative efforts are necessary for fostering a deeper understanding and appreciation of the complex historical relationship between these two cultures.

Failure to adhere to these guidelines may perpetuate the prevailing lack of interest in Spanish colonialism in Morocco within traditional historical narratives. Henceforth, the historiography on the Spanish Protectorate must escape from the parallel trajectory it has followed alongside traditional Spanish historiography and transcend the confines imposed by the hegemony of the Spanish academic community. Otherwise, it will continue, regrettably and as the title of this article suggests, trapped behind a one-way mirror.

Bibliography

- Abrihach, Mohammed. "España y la batalla de Annual en El poema de Dhar Oubarran. (Epopeya poética rifeña de 1921)." *Studia historica. Historia contemporánea* (2022): 73-92.
- Akmir, Youssef. "La conciencia colectiva española frente a las guerras coloniales del norte de Marruecos (1909-1921)." *Norba. Revista de Historia* 29-30 (2016-2017): 69-85.
- _____. "De la potencia invasora a la potencia protectora. La percepción de España en el norte de Marruecos (1860-1923)." *Awraq: Estudios sobre el mundo árabe e islámico contemporáneo* 5-6 (2012): 157-76.
- Almuiña, Celso. "El Desastre de Annual (1921): su proyección sobre la opinión pública española." *Investigaciones Históricas* 8 (1988): 181-245.
- Álvarez Rey, Leandro, Gómez Porrúa, Álvaro y José Leonardo Ruiz Sánchez (coord.). *Guerra del Rif. Cien años después. XV Jornadas nacionales de historia militar. Cátedra General Castaños*. Sevilla: Editorial Universidad de Sevilla, 2023.
- Arias González, Luis. "El sentimiento popular ante la guerra de Marruecos." In *Historia militar de Asturias*, ed. José Girón Garrote, 116-34. Oviedo: Silverio Cañada, 2006.
- Aziza, Mimoun. *España y el Rif, miradas cruzadas*. Madrid: Diwan Mayrit, 2023.
- _____. *La sociedad rifeña frente al Protectorado español de Marruecos (1912-1956)*. Barcelona: Ediciones Bellaterra, 2003.
- Azpeitúa, Antonio. *Marruecos, la mala semilla (Ensayo de análisis objetivo de cómo fue sembrada la guerra en África)*. Madrid: Imprenta clásica española, 1921.
- Balfour, Sebastian. *Abrazo mortal. De la guerra colonial a la Guerra Civil en España y Marruecos (1909-1939)*. Barcelona: Península, 2002.
- _____. *El fin del imperio español (1898-1923)*. Barcelona: Crítica, 1995.
- Ballbé, Manuel. *Orden público y militarismo en la España constitucional, 1812-1983*. Madrid: Alianza, 1983.
- Barral Martínez, Margarita. "El africanismo como instrumento del nacionalismo español a principios del siglo XX: la Conferencia de Algeciras." *Jerónimo Zurita* 88 (2013): 275-295.
- Bastos Ansart, Francisco. *El Desastre de Annual: Melilla en julio de 1921*. Barcelona: Minerva, 1921.
- Bermúdez Mombiola, Alfonso. "El Desastre de Annual y la ciudad de Zaragoza." In *Guerra del Rif. Cien años después. XV Jornadas nacionales de historia militar. Cátedra General Castaños*, coord. Leandro Álvarez Rey, Álvaro Gómez Porrúa y José Leonardo Ruiz Sánchez, 305-26. Sevilla: Editorial Universidad de Sevilla, 2023.
- _____. "Colonial Wars and Public Opinion in a Comparative Perspective." In *Examining colonial wars and their impact on contemporary military history*, eds. Miguel Madueño Álvarez and Alberto Guerrero Martin, 1-19. IGI Global, 2023.
- _____. "Voluntarios y conscriptos. Una comparativa del uso de tropas coloniales a nivel europeo y el caso español." In *Combatientes en las guerras coloniales*, eds. Miguel Madueño Álvarez y Pedro Panera Martínez, 11-24. Madrid: Dykinson, 2023.
- _____. *Colonialismo español a principios del siglo XX. El impacto de las guerras de marruecos en Zaragoza (1906-1927)*. Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidad de Zaragoza, 2021.
- _____. "¡Abajo la guerra! Aproximaciones a la oposición a la guerra del Rif en la Zaragoza de principios del siglo XX (1909-1923)." *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 5.10 (2016): 264-82.
- Besteiro, Julián. *El Partido Socialista y el problema de Marruecos*. Ciudad de México: Editorial Pablo Iglesias, 1921.
- Bordería Ortiz, Enrique y Antonio Laguna Platero. "Al servicio del imperio. Estrategias de desinformación en la guerra del norte de África." In *Comunicación y guerra en la historia*, ed. Alberto Pena, 663-82. Santiago de Compostela, Tórculo Edicions, 2004.
- Boutbouqalt, Tayeb. *La Guerre du Rif et la réaction de l'opinion internationale, 1921-1926*. Casablanca: Najah El Jadida, 1992.
- Boyd, Carolyn. *Praetorian Politics in Liberal Spain*. North Carolina: Chapel Hill, 1979.

- Bullejos, José. *Marruecos y la política imperialista*. París: Bureau d'Éditions, 1928.
- Busquets, Julio. *Pronunciamientos y golpes de Estado en España*. Madrid: Planeta, 1982.
- Caballero Domínguez, Margarita. "La cuestión marroquí y su corolario de Annual como causa y consecuencia de la crisis del sistema restauracionista." *Investigaciones históricas: Época moderna y contemporánea* 17 (1997): 219-42.
- Cabanillas, Alfredo. *La epopeya del soldado. Desde el Desastre de Annual hasta la reconquista de Monte Arruit*. Madrid: Imprenta clásica española, 1922.
- Campoamor, José María. *La actitud de España en la cuestión de Marruecos*. Madrid: CSIC, 1951.
- Camus Bergareche, Bruno y Anna Scicolone (eds). *Annual. Ecos de la última aventura colonial española*. Madrid: Catarata, 2021.
- Cardona, Gabriel. *El poder militar en la España contemporánea hasta la Guerra Civil*. Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1983.
- Carr, Raymond. *España 1808-1939*. Barcelona: Ariel, 1969.
- Cerro Aguilar, Enrique. *Camino de Annual. Albacete y el Desastre de 1921*. Albacete: Instituto de Estudios Albacetenses "Don Juan Manuel," 2007.
- De Escoriaza, Teresa. *Del dolor de la guerra: (crónicas de la campaña de Marruecos)*. Madrid: Pueyo, 1921.
- De Madariaga, María Rosa. *Los moros que trajo Franco*. Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 2015.
- _____. *Marruecos, ese gran desconocido: breve historia del protectorado español*. Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 2013.
- _____. *En el Barranco del Lobo. Las guerras de Marruecos*. Madrid: Alianza, 2005.
- _____. *España y el Rif. Crónica de una historia casi olvidada*. Melilla: La Biblioteca de Melilla, 1999.
- _____. "Nacionalismos vasco y catalán frente a la revolución de Abd-el-Krim." *Historia* 16, Año XXII, 268 (1998): 69-77.
- _____. "Le Parti socialiste espagnol et le Parti communiste d'Espagne face à la révolte rifaine." In *VVAA: Abd-el-Krim et la République du Rif*, 308-66. París: François Maspero, 1976.
- De Reparaz, Gonzalo. *Historia de la colonización*. Barcelona: Editorial Labor, 1935.
- _____. *Alfonso XIII y sus cómplices (memorias de una las víctimas). En las que se ve lo que ha cambiado España en veinte años (1911-1931)*. Madrid: Imprenta Prensa Moderna, 1931.
- Hernández Mir, Francisco. *Del desastre a la victoria: (1921-1926): ante las hordas del Rif*. Madrid: Librería Fernando Fe, 1926.
- _____. *Del Desastre al fracaso. Un mando funesto*. Madrid: Pueyo, 1922.
- Gajate Bajo, María y Alfonso Iglesias Amorín. "Dosier: Annual, 1921: el desastre que cambió a un país." *Studia historica. Historia contemporánea* 39 (2022).
- Gajate Bajo, María. "Las campañas de Marruecos y la opinión pública. Una puesta al día." *Hispania* 79/263 (2019): 727-56.
- _____. "El Protectorado, las campañas hispano-marroquíes y la opinión pública (1902-1923)." *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 8, 16 (2019): 82-103.
- _____. "El desastre de Annual. El pleito de las responsabilidades en la gran prensa (1921-1923)." *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 3 (2013): 119-138.
- _____. *Las campañas de Marruecos y la opinión pública: el ejemplo de Salamanca y su prensa*. Madrid: Instituto universitario general Gutiérrez Mellado, 2012.
- _____. "La Guerra de Marruecos en una ciudad del interior Salamanca, de Annual al golpe de estado." *Revista de historia militar* 104 (2008): 73-138.
- Gamazo Maura, Gabriel y Melchor Fernández Almagro. *Por qué cayó Alfonso XIII*. Madrid: Ambos Mundos, 1948.
- García-Consuegra, Mariano. *Los aviones del pueblo: el aeroplano "Ciudad Real"*. Ciudad Real: Diputación Provincial de Ciudad Real, 2015.
- García de la Rasilla Ortega, M^a del Carmen. *Los problemas de Marruecos y la opinión pública Vallisoletana (1898-1927)*. Memoria de Licenciatura, Universidad de Valladolid, 1985.
- _____. "Palencia y la guerra de Marruecos (1909-1927)." In *VVAA: Actas del I Congreso de*

- Historia de Palencia. Tomo III. Edad Moderna y edad Contemporánea*, 715-23. Palencia: Diputación Provincial de Palencia, 1987.
- García Figueras, Tomás. *Historia de la acción de España en Marruecos. Desde 1904 a 1927*. Barcelona: Ediciones Fe, 1939.
- García Palomares, Antonio. *El origen del periodismo de guerra actual en España: el análisis de los corresponsales en el conflicto del norte de África entre 1893 y 1925*. Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2014.
- García Venero, Maximiano. *Santiago Alba, monárquico de razón*. Madrid: Aguilar, 1963.
- Gil Grimau, Rodolfo. *Aproximación a una bibliografía española sobre el Norte de África*. Madrid: Ministerio de Asuntos Exteriores, 1988.
- Gómez Hidalgo, Francisco. *La tragedia prevista*. Madrid: Imprenta de Juan Pueyo, 1921.
- González González, Irene. "El papel social de la prensa en tiempo de conflicto: la provincia de Toledo y el desastre de Annual." Conference in *XXV Encuentro del FIMAM* (Foro de Investigación sobre Mundo Árabe y Musulmán), 16/11/2023.
- Goy de Silva, Ruy. *Borrón y cuenta nueva. Crónicas de Marruecos*. Alcoy: s. n., 1923.
- Guerra Hernández, Jennifer. *Canarias ante la Guerra de Marruecos (1909-1927). Miradas desde el Atlántico*. Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Editorial Cabildo Insular de Gran Canaria, 2020.
- _____. *El impacto de la Guerra de Marruecos en Canarias (1909-1927)*. Tesis doctoral, Universidad de las Palmas de Gran Canaria, 2016.
- Guixé, Juan. *El Rif en sombras. Lo que yo he visto en Melilla*. Madrid: s. n., 1922.
- Iglesias Amorín, Alfonso y Rocío Velasco de Castro. "La Guerra del Rif (1921-1926) y las memorias conflictivas entre España y Marruecos." *Memoria Y Civilización* 26.2 (2023): 101-23.
- Iglesias-Amorín, Alfonso. *Marruecos, panteón del Imperio español (1859-1931)*. Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2022.
- _____. "The Hispano-Moroccan Wars (1859-1927) and the (De)nationalization of the Spanish People." *European History Quarterly* 50, 2 (2020): 290-310.
- _____. "La evolución de la imagen de las guerras de Marruecos y su difusión en la opinión pública (1859-1927)." *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 8.16 (2019): 104-31.
- _____. "Dossier: España y Marruecos guerra y colonialismo en los siglos XIX y XX." *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar*, Vol. 8, 16 (2019).
- _____. *La memoria de las Guerras de Marruecos en España (1859-1936)*. Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidade de Santiago de Compostela, 2015.
- Jensen, Geoffrey. "The Spanish-Moroccan Military Campaigns in the Context of European Colonial History." *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 8, 16 (2019): 17-40.
- La Porte, Pablo. "Marruecos y la crisis de la Restauración, 1917-1923." *Ayer* 63 (2006): 53-74.
- _____. *La atracción del imán. El Desastre de Annual y sus repercusiones en la política europea (1921-1923)*. Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2001.
- _____. *El Desastre de Annual y la crisis de la Restauración en España (1921-1923)*. Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 1997.
- _____. "El desastre de Annual, ¿un olvido historiográfico?." *Cuadernos de historia contemporánea* 19 (1997): 223-30.
- Leguineche, Manuel. *Annual, el desastre de España en el Rif*. Madrid: Alfaguara, 1996.
- Lleixá, Joachim. *100 años de militarismo en España*. Barcelona: Anagrama, 1986.
- López García, Bernabé. *El socialismo español y el anticolonialismo (1898-1914)*. Madrid: Cuadernos para el Diálogo (suplemento), 1976.
- López Rienda, Rafael. *Frente al fracaso. Raisuni, de Silvestre a Burguete*. Madrid: Sociedad General Española de Librería, 1923.
- _____. *El escándalo del millón de Larache. Datos, antecedentes y derivaciones de las inmoralidades en Marruecos*. Madrid: Sáez Hermanos, 1922.
- Macías Fernández, Daniel y María Gajate Bajo. "Ni contigo ni sin ti: la africanidad en el discurso de los militares africanistas (1909-1927)." *El Futuro del Pasado: revista electrónica de historia* 14 (2023): 377-408.

- Macías Fernández, Daniel (ed). *A cien años de Annual. La guerra de Marruecos*. Madrid: Desperta Ferro Ediciones, 2021.
- _____. *Franco “nació en África”: Los africanistas y las Campañas de Marruecos*. Madrid: Tecnos, 2019.
- Mackenzie, John M. (ed.). *European empires and the people: popular responses to imperialism in France, Britain, the Netherlands, Belgium, Germany and Italy*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2011.
- Marchante Moralejo, Carmen. *La correspondencia de Annual. Escritos de familiares de soldados y oficiales en las posiciones de la Comandancia General de Melilla al Ministerio de la Guerra. Estudio preliminar y edición comentada de los textos*. Melilla: UNED. Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia, 2023.
- Martín Corrales, Eloy. “Las guerras de Marruecos y la opinión pública española: 1859-1958.” In *La guerra de Marruecos y la España de su tiempo*, ed. Francisco Alía Miranda, 135-52. Ciudad Real: Sociedad Don Quijote, 2009.
- _____. *La imagen del magrebí en España: una perspectiva histórica: siglos XVI-XX*. Barcelona: Bellaterra, 2002.
- _____. “El cine español y las guerras de Marruecos (1896-1994).” *Hispania: Revista española de historia* 55, 190 (1995): 693-708.
- Martin-Márquez, Susan. *Disorientations: Spanish Colonialism in Africa and the Performance of Identity*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008.
- Martínez Milán, Jesús y Jennifer Guerra Hernández. “El desastre de Annual a través de la prensa canaria: una breve introducción.” *Boletín de la Real Sociedad Económica de Amigos del País de Tenerife* 1 (2010): 377-92.
- Martínez Gallego, Francesc Andreu y Antonio Laguna Platero. “Comunicación, propaganda y censura en la guerra hispanomarroquí (1906-1923).” *Comunicación y Sociedad* 27.3 (2014): 43-63.
- Martínez Reverte, Jorge. *El vuelo de los buitres: El desastre de Annual y la guerra del Rif*. Barcelona: Galaxia Gutenberg, 2021.
- Maturana Vargas, Carlos. *La Trágica realidad: Marruecos*. Barcelona: Editorial Cervantes, 1921.
- Moga Romero, Vicente. *La cuestión marroquí en la escritura africanista una aproximación a la contribución bibliográfica y editorial española al conocimiento del norte de Marruecos (1859-2006)*. Barcelona: Bellaterra, 2008.
- Morales Lezcano, Víctor. *El colonialismo hispano-francés en Marruecos (1898-1927)*. Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1976.
- Morales Tamaral, José Manuel. “A la conquista de las masas. Los orígenes de la propaganda estatal en la España de entreguerras, 1917-1936.” *Rúbrica Contemporánea* 5/10 (2016): 65-83.
- Moreno Juste, Antonio. “*El Socialista* y el Desastre de Annual: opinión y actitud socialista ante la derrota.” *Cuadernos de Historia Contemporánea* 12 (1990): 103-32.
- Pando, Juan. *Historia secreta de Annual*. Madrid: Temas de Hoy, 1999.
- Parra Monserrat, David. *La narrativa del africanismo franquista: génesis y prácticas socio-educativas*. Tesis doctoral inédita, Universitat de Valencia, 2012.
- Payne, Stanley. *Politics and the Military in Modern Spain*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1967.
- Ramiro de la Mata, Javier. *Origen y dinámica del colonialismo español en Marruecos*. Ceuta: Ciudad Autónoma de Ceuta, 2001.
- Recio García, M^a Ángeles. “El desastre de Annual en el Parlamento español: las Comisiones de Responsabilidades.” *Revista Digital de Guerra Colonial* 2 (2018): 61-78.
- Rius Sanchís, Inmaculada y Francesc Andreu Martínez Gallego. “Los lápices rojos del africanismo: control informativo en la guerra de Marruecos.” In *Comunicación y guerra en la historia*, ed. Alberto Pena, 825-50. Santiago de Compostela, Tórculo Edicions, 2004.
- Romero Basart, Luis. *La guerra de Marruecos o cómo se engaña a un pueblo*. Tetuán: Casa Gomariz, 1930.

- Rubio Campaña, Antonio. *Periodistas españoles en la guerra del Rif: 1921-1923. Origen del periodismo de investigación en España*. Tesis doctoral inédita, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2005.
- Ruiz Llano, Germán. “Álava ante el Desastre de Annual.” *Estudios Alaveses* 32 (2010): 145-166.
- Sèbe, Bernie. *Heroic imperialists in Africa. The promotion of British and French colonial heroes, 1870-1939*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2013.
- Seco Serrano, Carlos. *Militarismo y civilismo en la España contemporánea*. Madrid: Instituto de Estudios Económicos, 1984.
- _____. *Alfonso XIII y la crisis de la restauración*. Barcelona: Ariel, 1969.
- Torres Delgado, Gemma. *La virilitat d’Espanya a l’Àfrica. Nació i masculinitat al colonialisme al Marroc (1880-1927)*. Barcelona: Afers, 2020.
- _____. “Emociones viriles y la experiencia de la nación imperial en las Guerras del Rif (1909-1927).” *Studia historica. Historia contemporánea* 38 (2020): 99-127.
- _____. “La reivindicación de la nación civilizada: masculinidad española en el discurso colonial sobre Marruecos (1900-1927).” *Cuadernos De Historia Contemporánea* 39 (2017): 59-81.
- _____. “La nación viril. Imágenes masculinas de España en el africanismo reaccionario después de la derrota de Annual (1921-1927).” *Ayer* 106.2 (2017): 133-58.
- _____. *Masculinitat i colonització a Espanya: arquetips masculins al discurs colonial sobre el Marroc (1880-1927)*. Tesis doctoral, Universitat de Barcelona, 2016.
- Tusell, Javier. *La España del siglo XX*. Barcelona: Crítica, 1975.
- _____. *Radiografía de un golpe de estado: el ascenso al poder del General Primo de Rivera*. Madrid: Alianza, 1987.
- Velasco de Castro, Rocío. “Percepciones del Protectorado español y su legado: lengua, cultura y literatura españolas en el Marruecos postcolonial.” *Historia del presente* 41 (2023): 11-26.
- _____. “Dossier: España y Marruecos: del desastre de Annual a la dictadura de Primo de Rivera (1921-1930).” *Hispania Nova* 20 (2022).
- _____. “En torno al centenario de Annual: Abdelkrim y la resistencia armada contra el colonialismo español.” In *En la Europa liberal: el deber y la compasión*, coord. Enrique San Miguel Pérez, 145-70. Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 2021.
- _____. “La lucha anti-colonial en el protectorado español según la historiografía marroquí: Raisuni y Abdelkrim.” *Revista Universitaria de Historia Militar* 8, 16 (2019): 41-60.
- Victoria Moreno, Diego. *Dolor y vergüenza: el recuerdo de Annual (1921). El fracaso político-militar en el Protectorado Español de Marruecos*. Cartagena: Ediciones Nova Spartaria, 2021.
- Vivero, Augusto. *El derrumbamiento: la verdad sobre el desastre del Rif*. Madrid: Rafael Caro Raggio, 1922.

العنوان: نظرة أحادية الاتجاه: معركة أنوال (1921)، في محك الاستوغرافيا الإسبانية، ورهاناتها الأكاديمية.

الملخص: يهدف هذا المقال إلى تقديم استعراض متوازن للحالة الراهنة للاستوغرافيا الإسبانية المتعلقة بتاريخ الحماية الإسبانية في المغرب، مع التركيز بصفة خاصة على الأعمال الأكاديمية ذات الصلة بكارثة/معركة أنوال في عام 1921. وفي هذا الصدد، يحاول المقال إجراء مراجعة منهجية تسعى إلى فحص واسع النطاق لجملة من الأعمال الأكاديمية حول هذا الموضوع، بغية تقييم الحالة الراهنة لهذا الحقل من الدراسات على المستوى الأكاديمي، وكذلك التحديات والمشاكل التي يواجهها هذا الصنف من الاستوغرافيا. ويخلص المقال إلى أنه على الرغم من الزيادة الكبيرة في كمية الأعمال المخصصة لمعالجة موضوع تاريخ أنوال والنكبة التي جسدها، إلا أنها تظل في منزلة الدراسات التي لا تتمتع جميعها بقيمة أكاديمية ماثلة. وفضلا عن ذلك، فإن الاستوغرافيا الإسبانية لتاريخ الحماية، لم تنخرط في حوار مثمر مع مثيلتها الصادرة عن الأبحاث والدراسات المغربية، فظلت تبعا لهذا، وفي الوقت ذاته مهمشة في المجالات الأكاديمية الأكثر هيمنة داخل أوساط النظام الجامعي الإسباني.

الكلمات المفتاحية: الإستوغرافيا الإسبانية، المغرب، أنوال، 1921.

Titre: Un miroir unidirectionnel: L'historiographie espagnole face au retrait d'Annual (Anwal, 1921)

Résumé: Le but de cet article est de fournir un examen équilibré de l'état actuel de l'historiographie espagnole sur l'histoire du protectorat espagnol au Maroc, avec un accent particulier sur les articles académiques liés au désastre/Bataille d'Anwal en 1921. On a procédé à une révision sommaire historiographique sur le sujet à partir des travaux universitaires, et on a relevé les défis, ainsi que les problèmes actuels auxquels ce type d'historiographie est confronté. L'article conclut, qu'en dépit de l'augmentation significative du nombre de travaux sur la bataille d'Anwal, tous n'ont pas la même valeur académique. En outre, l'historiographie espagnole sur l'histoire du Protectorat espagnol n'a pas engagé un dialogue productif avec l'historiographie marocaine et, en même temps, elle reste marginalisée dans les sphères académiques les plus dominantes du système universitaire espagnol.

Mots-clés: Historiographie espagnole, Maroc, Annual (Anwal), 1921.